

**RE: Cases in 1980 with Participation in 2004 Study**

**Bob Benson** to: Brattin, Bill

01/20/2011 11:01 AM

From: Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US

To: "Brattin, Bill" <brattin@srcinc.com>

---

I know we decided to give precedence to all those who participated in 2004 (the 252) and eliminated the 252 from the 1980 data set. I am questioning that decision for #17289 and #18733.

Because both had discrete pleural thickening in 1980, the exposure to 1980 was the "cause" not the exposure to 2000. Using the lower exposure in 1980 probably will not change the modeling result.

"Brattin, Bill" ---01/20/2011 10:39:33 AM---I do not understand your question. These are 2 people for whom we have data from 1980 and 2004. To

From: "Brattin, Bill" <brattin@srcinc.com>

To: Bob Benson/R8/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 01/20/2011 10:39 AM

Subject: RE: Cases in 1980 with Participation in 2004 Study

---

I do not understand your question. These are 2 people for whom we have data from 1980 and 2004. To avoid "repeat observations", we keep the data from 2004 and omit the data from 1980. The CE value we want is that which applies at the time of x-ray (2004), not that which existed in 1980. Am I missing something?

\*\*\*\*\*

Bill Brattin  
SRC, Inc.  
999 18th Street, Suite 1975  
Denver CO 80202  
[brattin@srcinc.com](mailto:brattin@srcinc.com)  
303-357-3121

**From:** Benson.Bob@epamail.epa.gov [Benson.Bob@epamail.epa.gov]

**Sent:** Thursday, January 20, 2011 11:33 AM

**To:** Brattin, Bill

**Subject:** Cases in 1980 with Participation in 2004 Study

---

**From:** Benson.Bob@epamail.epa.gov [Benson.Bob@epamail.epa.gov]

**Sent:** Thursday, January 20, 2011 11:33 AM

**To:** Brattin, Bill

**Subject:** Cases in 1980 with Participation in 2004 Study

#17289, #17847, and #18733 had discrete pleural thickening in 1980.

We decided to not count the 1980 result for #17847 as he showed no effect in the 2004 study. I agree with assigning this person as no effect and using the cumulative exposure calculated until 2000.

However, #17289 and #18733 had discrete pleural thickening in 1980 and 2004. Shouldn't we be using the

cumulative exposure and latency values as of 6/1/1980 for these two individuals?

For #17289, the exposure in 1980 was 33.509 and in 2000 was 34.046.

For #18733, the exposure in 1980 was 0.091 and in 2000 was 0.149.